



Religious Moderation in Islamic Religious Education as a Response to Intolerance Attitudes in Indonesian Educational Institutions

by Muhammad Hajarul Aswad

IAIN PALOPO

Submission date: 27-Oct-2023 04:50AM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 2208378134

File name: 4677-14579-1-PB_1.pdf (386.84K)

Word count: 7947

Character count: 47447

Religious Moderation in Islamic Religious Education as a Response to Intolerance Attitudes in Indonesian Educational Institutions

Muhaemin¹, Rusdiansyah², Mustaqim Pabbajah³, Hasbi⁴

Abstract

Intolerance attitudes are still common in school environments, and governments must dedicate efforts to building religious moderation attitudes in society. It is explained in this study that intolerance cases have not been effectively reduced by religious moderation in religious and moral education learning in public schools. A descriptive qualitative approach was applied with data sources through observations, interviews, and textbook documents. The study objectively described religious moderation content in textbooks, the allocation of Islamic religious education (PAI) learning in schools, and the supporting activities of religious moderation in schools. The content of the textbooks on Islamic religious and moral education has not yet contained comprehensive religious moderation indicators. It can be seen from the religious indicators' classification, such as national commitment, tolerance, antiviolenace, and accommodation of local culture, that less time is available for religious and moral education. Therefore, the content of religious moderation needs to be integrated into all subjects. Likewise, extracurricular activities must be activated and filled by strengthening religious moderation, including Islamic spiritual activities. The importance of the understanding of teachers on religious moderation was proven by this finding because teachers are role models for students in religious attitudes. Additionally, evaluation is needed for educational stakeholders, such as educators, curriculum, and time allocation, to reduce intolerance cases. School stakeholders can be role models for implementing religious moderation in and out of schools.

Keywords: educational institutions, intolerance, moderation of religion, religious education

Introduction

Amid government efforts supported by various components of society to disseminate religious moderation, intolerance cases have continued to appear in different Indonesian regions in recent years (Mackey & Dolven, 2020; Sebastian & Arifianto, 2020). Intolerance cases have become a global fact in various countries and have emerged in educational institutions through the attitudes of students in schools (Brabeck et al., 2000; Gerlinger, 2017; Parker, 2014). In addition to the school environment, intolerance cases also appear in other forms, including the difficulty of

¹Dr. State Islamic Institute of Palopo, Sulawesi Indonesia, Email: muhaemin@iainpalopo.ac.id

²State Islamic Institute of Palopo, Sulawesi Indonesia, Email: rusdiansyah@iainpalopo.ac.id

³Universitas Teknologi Yogyakarta, Indonesia, Email: mustaqim_pabbajah@uty.ac.id

⁴Dr. State Islamic Institute of Palopo, Sulawesi Indonesia, Email: hasbi@iainpalopo.ac.id

building worship houses, the attack on worship houses, the disbandment of religious activities by specific community organizations, juvenile delinquency, and other cases. For example, the Setara Institute reported at least 180 incidents of disbandment of freedom of religion and worship, with 422 actions in 2020 (equivalent-institute.org). The number of intolerance cases shown in the data is very worrying, even amid the pandemic. Adults and students dominate the perpetrators of intolerance cases. Still, university students are susceptible to intolerant acts (Sirry, 2020). Based on the previous data, it is necessary to review the dissemination pattern of religious moderation, including in educational institutions, which have strategic roles in instilling reliance value (Muhajir, 2022).

Academic researchers have not widely researched religious moderation in Islamic religious education curricula in educational institutions to respond to intolerant actions. Three aspects tend to be discussed in recent studies. The first study is related to religious moderation (Dodego & Witro, 2020; Feriyanto, 2020; Ridho, 2021), where moderation is a critical attitude to build in order not to be trapped in extreme actions. The second study regards religious moderation dissemination through social media (Anwar & Haq, 2019; Rohman, 2020; Wibowo, 2019). It was found in several studies that religious moderation can be disseminated through various media, including social media. The third study regards religious moderation dynamics in several communities (Anwar & Haq, 2019; Futaqi & Mashuri, 2021; Ramli, 2019). It was found in the study results that religious moderation dynamics are influenced by context and culture. The study that has been conducted provides a stimulus for this study, referring to the importance of religious moderation revitalization in educational institutions. This is especially true in curricula, learning time, and supporting activities for religious moderation in secondary educational institutions (Pilotti & Al Mubarak, 2021; Suntana & Tresnawaty, 2021).

This paper attempts to respond to this study by focusing on the need for religious moderation in the religious and moral education process. This effort was conducted by answering three questions. First, how is the content of religious moderation in high school religious and moral education textbooks? Religious moderation indicators in religious and moral education textbooks for grades X, XI, and XII were examined in this question. Second, how is the time allocation for religious and moral education in senior high schools described? Third, how are the supporting activities of religious moderation in learning religious and moral education in high school? This question

focused on describing the supportive activities conducted by teachers and students to internalize religious moderation values in schools. These three questions were answered in the next section. Additionally, this study was based on three arguments. First, the content of the religious and moral education textbooks in senior high schools did not comprehensively contain religious moderation indicators. These indicators were national commitment, tolerance, non-violence, and accommodation of local culture. Second, the time allocation for religious and moral learning activities was insufficient. Therefore, moderation content should be integrated into all subjects. Third, activities to support religious moderation conducted by teachers or students must be improved. The activities of students, such as the Islamic Spiritual Organization (Rohis), should also be evaluated to contribute to instilling religious moderation values and not producing exclusive students.

Literature Review

Religious Moderation

Religious moderation is closely related to maintaining togetherness by realizing a tolerant attitude toward human beings and not imposing a will with violence (Akhmadi, 2019). Fahrudin et al. (2021) emphasized that in realizing national and religious harmony, a religious moderation attitude is necessary to limit the excesses of religious groups (not extreme) attitudes in claiming that their religion is the only true religion. Furthermore, religious moderation is meaningless in mixing truth and eliminating self-identity. However, this moderation was less extreme toward other unconsentaneous beliefs (Akhmadi, 2019). Moderation theories are implemented as adaptations and compromises focusing on the interests or ideological devices that make this moderation happen (Somer, 2017). At the same time, Sihombing et al. (2020) proposed religious moderation as creating inclusiveness in exploring the world and respecting truth and goodness in viewing existing religions.

Moderation in Islam is a new paradigm for Islamic understanding by upholding values that promote the unity and integrity of the denomination and Islam to build human civilization, such as the importance of *tasamuh*, *pluralism*, and *ukhuwah* Islamiyah (Agis et al., 2018). Religious moderation is also implemented by religious community organizations by applying Ahlussunah Waljamaah theology, which is well established and consistent in various fields (Kanafi et al., 2021). This diverse moderation is also manifested in the Christian interpretation of teachings, where religious moderation becomes a perspective to mediate the extremities of Christian

teachings. One is by interacting well with the teachings of other religions (Sutrisno, 2019). In Hinduism, religious moderation is implemented in *Puja Tri Sandhya* and *PancaSembah* in the Indonesian context (Agis et al., 2018).

Moreover, in Buddhism teaching, religious moderation is implemented from the enlightenment of the Buddha Sidarta Gautama, who created four prasetyas: helping one another, rejecting worldly desires, studying, experiencing, and trying to achieve perfect enlightenment. Religious moderation also occurs in the Confucian religion, which is reflected in the Confucian junzi people with a Yin-Yang life view without extreme attitudes (Sutrisno, 2019). In this case, religion has taught a tolerant attitude, which becomes the basis for the vocalization of the religious moderation concept.

5

Islamic Religious Education Curriculum

The educational curriculum is one of the education components essential to achieving academic goals and is a reference in implementing the teaching and learning process for all education levels (Nurmadiyah, 2016). There are several interrelated components in the learning curriculum to achieve educational goals. Some of these components are the plans that will be achieved within the scope of the school and within the range of the field of study, curriculum content, teaching media, teaching strategies, learning processes, and evaluation (Aman, 2020).

Additionally, an adequate curriculum also contains three primary roles. The first is the conservative role of preserving cultural value as a noble heritage associated with globalization and advancing science and technology (Wafi, 2017). Furthermore, the curriculum is expected to reject the negative influences that can damage the morale of students. The second is the creative role, namely the curriculum, which is expected to address every challenge to the development and needs of a dynamic society. The third is the critical and evaluative role of globalization (Kusmawati & Surachman, 2019).

33

One of the educational curricula in Indonesia is the Islamic religious education curriculum. It deals with religious learning in Indonesian education, which is widely discussed to overcome conflicts and radicalism attitudes covered by religion. The religious education curriculum is essential to instill spiritual values and tolerance in students. Hatim (2018), in his study, argued that the curriculum in Islamic education in schools contains several aspects, such as aspects of the Qur'an Hadith, Aqidah, Morals, Fiqh (Islamic Law), and Tarikh (history) aspects. Islamic religious education applied in the school environment attempts to internalize Islamic teachings and values

10

in students to deal with the previous statement (Wafi, 2017). Nowadays, the current studies referring to Islamic education curriculum development are based on the thoughts of Muhaimin, namely the development by using an academic subject approach, a humanistic approach, a technological approach, and social reconstruction education, and by combining intelligence IQ (*intelligent quotient*), EQ (*emotional quotient*), and SQ (*spiritual quotient*) (Anwar, 2016; Khakim, 2018; Muhaimin, 2014). At the same time, success in realizing the curriculum that becomes the goal in the learning process is also greatly determined by the role of the teacher, where teachers are expected to be able to create good learning programs with the outlined curriculum (Dhani, 2020; Juahab, 2019; Nurhasanah, 2020). It can be concluded that a successful curriculum is the integrity of students and teachers in achieving the targets of the applied curriculum (Gunio, 2021; Nasir, 2021; Nyamai, 2021).

Educational Institutions

Educational institutions are defined as valuable media for fostering human beings whose purpose is to create a better future (Gazali, 2013). Educational institutions are distinguished based on informal, formal, and non-formal. The first, informal educational institutions, refer to family educational institutions, where education in the family is the first education accepted by children, and the role of parents is significant in this institution (Rodríguez Illera, 2018). The second formal educational institution refers to schools that produce individuals with intellectual abilities and skills (Shoji et al., 2020). This institution involves the roles of teachers and students. Some of the characteristics of formal institutions are specifically organized and divided into types and levels that have hierarchical relationships. In the Indonesian education context, it is divided into elementary (elementary school), junior high (junior high school), and high school (SMA) levels (Zuchdi et al., 2014). Therefore, formal educational institutions established by the government are intended to answer future educational needs. At the same time, the school is also an institution for creativity development, and the development process can differ among schools. Some factors that cause these differences are the type of school, and the teaching style students perceive (Besançon & Lubart, 2008). Third, the existence of nonformal educational institutions in society is supposed to acquire knowledge and relevant experience. One non-formal education is realized to reduce the quality gap in the community (Kicherova & Efimova, 2020).

At the same time, the radicalism movement and religious intolerance that has recently appeared are often associated with education. A tolerant attitude toward avoiding radical thoughts in students has been instilled by many educational institutions, such as formal schools, to deal with this case. Schools are good educational institutions that stimulate the creative thinking skills of students (De Alencar et al., 2017). So far, learning in schools has discussed tolerance inculcation between religious communities from kindergarten to high school in the Indonesian context (Djollong & Akbar, 2019; Ferdinand & Alpizar, 2021; Mandayu, 2020; Zain, 2020). Multicultural education is also applied in the curriculum, suitable in the Indonesian context, with many tribes, languages, races, and religions. It has the same purpose: to increase tolerance and create humanistic values (Shannon-Baker, 2018; Zilliacus et al., 2017). Religious tolerance among students may also be affected by the ability of teachers (in the formal education system) to convey religious material, in which tolerance values should be instilled in this learning. The education system is believed to raise and increase religious tolerance to achieve harmony in life (Lenssen, 2010). This tolerant attitude will later change the way of thinking from exclusive to inclusive, strengthening the sense of humanity, among others (Effendi, 2020). In conclusion, intolerance occurs due to the failure of educational institutions to internalize the tolerance concept to students.

Methods

Research Design

This study used content analysis design (Zhang & Wildemuth, 2016) and applied qualitative approach to analysis data (Creswell, 2014). Content analysis explored the meaning of text or document dealing with themes being investigated (Zhang & Wildemuth, 2016). This research focused on the content of religious moderation in learning Islamic religious education in senior high school (SMA). The contents of religious moderation originated from the Book of Islamic Religion and Moral Education issued by the Ministry of Education and Culture, the 2017 edition for grade X and XI, and the 2018 edition for grade XII. As the intolerance issue emerged in Indonesia, religious education learning that emphasized on the teaching values of tolerances and the negative aspects of intolerance was shared. The themes in the textbook were identified to see what themes appeared in the textbook and what topics were properly described in the textbook issued by the government. The textbook was evaluated and data were analyzed using content analysis technique suggested by Zhang & Wildemuth (2016).

15

Data and Sources of Data

Data of this study came from themes regarding tolerance matters identified from textbook used for SMA. The themes consisted of tolerance in religious practices, values of social interactions that required tolerance, tolerance among students, tolerance to the society that had different religion, and tolerance in the national issues. The sources of data in this study were three textbooks on Islamic Religion and Moral Education issued by the Ministry of Education and Culture. The textbooks were:

1. Islamic Religion and Moral Education for grade X SMA (2017)
2. Islamic Religion and Moral Education for grade XI SMA (2017)
3. Islamic Religion and Moral Education for grade XII SMA (2018)

Informant

The informants of this study were 6 teachers and 15 students selected through purposive sampling. Teachers were selected purposively from grade X, XI and XII. Teacher who taught Islamic Tolerance in each grade was selected. To see the perception of students, the students were selected 5 informants in each grade. With 21 informants, saturated data when interview was done had been achieved (Cresswell, 2014). Description of informants of this study appears in table 1.

Table 1

Informants of this study

No	Informants	Grade X	Grade XI	Grade XII	Total
1	Teacher	2	2	2	6
2	Student	5	5	5	15
		7	7	7	21

Data Collection Techniques

Three techniques were used to collect data in this study: document analysis, observation and interview (Cresswell, 2014). Document analysis was done to identify themes in three textbooks and classify what values have been defined in the textbook. To see how students and teachers implemented the tolerance values, the researchers conducted observations in each grade. In addition, interview was done to 21 informants. The interview was focused on teachers and students perception on the tolerance application in daily lives both in school and at homes. Interview was done at school where each informant was invited. Each informant needed 20-30 minutes for the interview. Results of the interview were recorded and the results of record were transcribed verbatim.

Data Analysis

This study used content analysis techniques to analyze data (Zhang & Mildemuth, 2016). Overall, data analysis from Zhang & Wildemuth (2016) were combined with theory from Cresswell (2014) and Miles, et. al., (2014). Data obtained from documents, i.e. three textbooks on Islamic Religion and Moral Education were mapped their themes and explored their meaning. At the indepth level, the data were combined with data from transcripts obtained from the observation and interview (Zhang & Wildemuth, 2016; Cresswell, 2014). Content analysis works can be summarized in four steps as follows:

1. Data in the forms of numbers and texts are converted into narrative text so that themes are indentified (Zhang & Wildemuth, 2016) and thematic analysis is available to make (Cresswell, 2014).
2. After data are identified their themes amd data are formed in the transcripts the second analysis is made. The themes are identified based on research questions (Zhang & Wildemuth, 2016) and the themes are grouped based on its categories (Miles, et.al., 2014).
3. After data have been identified their themes and the themes are groped into their classification and categories (Miles, et. al. 2014), coding system through numbering techniques of each theme categories are applied to all data and when improper numbering system appears the data are corrected (Zhang & Wildemuth (2016).
4. Data that have been numbered correctly are identified and the proper numbered data are selected as the final data (Zhang & Wildemuth, 2016; Miles, et al 2014). Data are defined into religious moderation indicators that see how religious moderation was practiced in schools. Four indicators of religious moderation were used: national commitment, love for the homeland, antiviolence, and accommodation to local culture. The values of religious moderation content in the Islamic Religious and Morals Education textbooks were classified based on religious moderation indicators.

IAIN PALOPO

Results

Religious Moderation Content in Islamic Religious Education Textbooks of High School Students

Islamic education textbooks in senior high schools are arranged by the government and implemented by teachers and students in the school. The Islamic Religious Education textbooks used as a reference in senior high schools are the Islamic Religious and Moral Education textbooks published by the Ministry of Education and Culture (2017 and 2018 editions).

The description of the religious moderation content of the textbook was elaborated based on religious moderation indicators. The textbook contents can be identified in Table 1. It can be seen from the table that several religious moderation content indicators were still extremely poorly mentioned in Islamic religious and moral education textbooks published by the Ministry of Education and Culture.

Table 2
Religious Moderation Contents in Islamic Religious and Moral Education Textbooks

Indicators	Class		
	X	XI	XII
National commitment	2	1	1
Tolerance	4	21	12
Antiviolence	19	8	14
Accommodating to local culture	-	1	1

The indicators for the national commitment content in class X textbooks were only revealed twice, tolerance was revealed four times, and antiviolence 19 times. Meanwhile, accommodating the local culture was not revealed at all. The indicator of national commitment in class XI was mentioned once, tolerance was mentioned 21 times, antiviolence was mentioned eight times, and accommodating to local culture was mentioned once. Additionally, the indicator of national commitment was mentioned once, tolerance was mentioned 12 times, antiviolence was mentioned 14 times, and accommodating to local culture was mentioned once.

Time Allocation of Islamic Religious Education Learning in Senior High School and the Tolerance Case

A lack of time allocation was shown in implementing Islamic religious education subjects in classes X, XII, and XII. Based on the 2013 curriculum used in schools, the amount of time

allocated for the PAI subject was only 3 h a week. One-hour lessons are only about 45 min long compared to general subjects, such as Indonesian, mathematics, and English subjects. The time allocation was 4 h a week.

Data Related to the Time Allocation of PAI Subjects in Schools were Obtained from Four PAI Teachers from Different Schools, as Revealed by the Four Respondents

"The duration of learning for PAI subjects is only three meetings a week. One meeting is only a one-hour lesson and takes only 45 minutes. (Interview, LA, ST, JS, HB, 2021)."

The lack of learning duration affects the lack of subject material explanation by the teacher acquired by the students, and it has also impacted the lack of comprehensiveness of the material of the students. One of the contents of religious learning in schools was tolerance. The tolerance value is an essential part of building harmony among human beings. However, intolerance cases have increasingly occurred in recent years, even in the school environment. A respondent revealed a tolerance case in schools.

"A high school teacher in Palopo City teaches and prohibits students from participating in Islamic events, such as Maulid Nabi and IsrajMi'raj. In addition, the teacher forbids students from praying together in class and asks the students to use Arabic for praying rather than Indonesian. (Interview, HB, 2021)."

The role of teachers in affecting the tolerant attitudes of students was shown in this statement. The instructions of the teachers were listened to and copied by the students when they prohibited students from participating in traditional religious activities. The teachers also did not allow the students to pray together when the lesson started. Likewise, there was a rule to use Arabic instead of Indonesian in praying. Those prohibitions affected the attitudes of students in joining the learning process, including the online learning activities currently applied. Another confirmation of this behavior by teachers was supported by this statement through WhatsApp:

"Some students do not want to participate in learning activities through the zoom meeting/google meeting application. This happens because religious teachers forbid their students from showing their faces in the media, either in photos or videos. (Interview, SP, 2021)."

In this case, many students were reluctant to join online subjects. The understanding conveyed by religious teachers dramatically affects student learning attitudes. Even when the students

participated in online learning, they did not show their faces. It also developed in the school environment, where potential intolerance ensued. Thus, religious moderation was an obstacle due to the religious understanding of teachers.

Religious Moderation Supporting Activities

Religious moderation dissemination has been implemented in schools in various ways. The Ministry of Religion released guidelines for implementing religious moderation and a religious moderation pocketbook in 2019. The existence of religious teachers in schools under the coordination of the Ministry has also received material on religious moderation. The Ministry of Religion has also placed some educational supervisors to supervise religious teachers in schools. Religious dissemination forms were conducted in more online media adapted to the pandemic situation since March 2020.

In the school environment, students engage in self-development activities. These activities are managed by school organizations, such as OSIS, Rohis, and several other student organizations. Rohis takes over religious-related activities, and Rohis conducts several activities, such as:

- a. Mabit spends the night together, starting with maghrib or Isha' and ending with fajr prayers.
- b. Daurah or training, namely activities that provide training to students, such as reciting the Qur'an (aimed at correcting the reading of the Qur'an).
- c. Mentoring/halaqah activities.

Besides those activities, several others were conducted in the school environment. Religious moderation values are supported by these activities.

From Table 2, there are four supporting activities to form a moderation attitude in schools. The first was a national commitment containing nationalist values and love for the homeland. The second was tolerance, reflected in the caring value and mutual understanding of others. The third was antiviolenace through mutual respect and support. The fourth was local culture accommodation through an attitude toward maintaining local culture. These values were indicators or contents of religious moderation. By following and implementing these activities, the students and teachers were expected to have a religious moderation attitude.

Discussion

Content of Religious Moderation in High School Islamic Religious Education Textbooks

Textbooks are guided books used by teachers to transfer knowledge to their students (Febrianto & Puspitaningsih, 2020; Jannah, 2016). For some subjects, the government has arranged textbooks to distribute to school principals and applied guided books to present their material. The contents of the textbooks significantly affected the attitudes and actions of the students because they tried to practice the contents of the textbooks they were studying. The rise in intolerance cases among high school students indicated the practice of what they had learned and obtained from the school. Knowledge of Islamic religious education (PAI) is about religion and, more importantly, the implementation of students from what they learned in their daily lives.

Table 3
Religious Moderation Supporting Activities

No.	Indicator moderation religion	Activities	Impact activities
1	National commitment	Flag ceremony	To train discipline and love for the homeland, nationalism
		Scout activities	To train nationalism and love for the homeland
		Flag hoisting troop activities	To train love for the homeland
		School security patrol (pks)	To train courage, discipline, and responsibility
2	Tolerance	Red cross youth activities	To train the attitude of caring, equality, and mutual understanding
		School health unit activities	To train the attitude of volunteerism, mutual understanding
		Nature lovers activities	To train the attitude of independence, universal values, and mutual understanding
3	Anti violence	Sports activities	To practice respect, sportsmanship, friendship
		Art activities	To practice respect, friendship
4	Local cultural accommodation	Scientific youth group activities	To practice respect, sportsmanship, friendship
		Mawlid commemoration	To maintain traditions, strengthen unity, increase Islamic insight, and ukhuwah
		Israimi'raj commemoration fast	
		Halal bi halal activities	
		Islamic new year activities	

Based on the identifying indicators, results of religious moderation content in the Islamic Religious and Moral Education textbooks for the SMA level were least categorized. Indicators of religious moderation used as a reference in viewing the contents of the PAI books were national

commitment, tolerance, antiviolence, and accommodation of local culture. Indicators of national commitment, tolerance, antiviolence, and accommodating to local culture become tools for measuring religious moderation in the education field (Basri, 2021). The lack of national commitment content for classes X, XI, and XII was determined by the lack of discussion in the book related to national commitment. Accommodative indicators of local culture in classes XI and XII were discussed once. Meanwhile, books were not discussed in class X. Tolerance and antiviolence were not discussed much. As literacy material for religious moderation, textbooks should contain the moderation values of restraint to become a "millennial jihad" effort to expand rahmatanLil 'Alamin (Wahyudi, 2021).

The lack of national commitment affects not loving homeland attitudes, separatist attitudes, and attitudes against national ideology, even tending to have unstable experiences (Yudi Latif, 2020). These attitudes will lead students to form organizations or movements to fight against the government of the Republic of Indonesia if it keeps increasing.

The lack of tolerance will lead students to become intolerant. There have been many cases in which students have done intolerant actions. Moreover, school intolerance has begun to emerge, such as a teacher instructing their students in the OSIS election to choose a chairperson with the same religion (Ikhsanudin, 2020). Additionally, in everyday interactions in school, students only socialize with the same faith friends. However, besides students, intolerance is also practiced by teachers or school principals. As in cases where there is a policy of wearing a hijab for all students, both Muslim and non-Muslims, or a ban on wearing it because people can control themselves and respect the differences or uniqueness of others without feeling threatened by their rights or beliefs (Abror, 2020).

Furthermore, the lack of antiviolence content will impact the attitudes of students toward juvenile delinquency, such as a quarrel among schools and others. The number of quarrels between students from year to year has increased. The last is the accommodative content of the local culture. This lack of content will impact the attitudes of students by not accepting the local culture associated with religion, where each region has local cultural potency that can be used as a reference in preventing conflict in the name of religion (Prasojo & Pabbajah, 2020). Meanwhile, the condition of Islam in the archipelago is an Islamic acculturation with local Indonesian cultures (Kato, 2018a, 2018b). In other words, Islam and culture are in dialogue with the local culture in Indonesia (Luthfi, 2016).

Including ² the content of religious moderation in the book, Islamic Religious Education is an absolute fact that stakeholders must do. This is because textbooks will become the material of the teacher, and the teacher will teach, instill, and raise the values contained in the book. In ⁴⁶ Islamic religious education, the importance of religious moderation must be enlarged so that students have ⁴⁰ a tolerant, inclusive, anti-violent attitude and respect for diversity. Thus, the ideals of harmony in the life of the nation may be achieved. Religious moderation values implementation or wasatiyah Islam will increase the balance between knowledge of life and skills; as a result, they become good human beings (Harto & Tastin, 2019).

² Characteristics of PAI Learning in Schools

The existence of religious education in schools is mandated by law, so it must be implemented. Still, it has not been able to run optimally because of minimal time and limited educator resources in its implementation. Religious education in schools should be a medium for character and cultural education simultaneously. According to Lyn Parker, religious education in schools is essential to building a tolerance culture (Parker, 2014). A school is a place for students to self-actualize, so the position of religious and moral education can be a trigger for an excellent religious spirit. The presence of spiritual and moral education is expected to contribute positively to building a tolerant and democratic character for educators, teaching staff, and students in schools. Based on these conditions, optimal implementation of religious learning in school can be achieved if there are efforts to improve learning motivation that motivates students to study and have an excellent religious attitude. It is possible to avoid spiritual understanding, contrary to the perspective of moderation. Religious learning is obtained through the learning process in school and can be found instantly through online media. Consequently, more religious knowledge is obtained virtually, dealing with the increasing religious spirit. However, it is vice versa with a good understanding of religion (Pabbajah et al., 2021). Furthermore, more systematic guidance is needed for religious teachers in schools so that religious education is not only formal but also interesting and beneficial.

²⁵ Strengthening supporters of religious moderation activities in schools

The Ministry of Religion implements religious moderation to maintain a moderate religious understanding of Indonesian society, which has become part of the national culture. However, intolerance in society has been shown in some recent research results, including among students

and college students. Sirry emphasized that many students had been trapped in radicalism and terrorism (Sirry, 2020). Based on these facts, religious moderation value must be valued in religious education, character, and other subjects. Likewise, strengthening religious moderation needs to be given to all educators, employees, and student organization coaches who interact with students in extracurricular activities.

Religious learning, in general, and in particular in schools, requires a new paradigm that is merely formalistic toward a contextual participatory paradigm. It should be vocalized because the religious moderation attitude creates harmony in denomination life, develops discussion culture, and maintains NKRI unity. In Kuwait, for example, religious education is not only in the relationship between individuals but also in religious education, which is expected to be a social unity in the context of the state (Alabdulhadi, 2019). It is to avoid predictions (Abdullah et al., 2019) that future threats will create excessive egoism (self-adolescence), greed, and widespread indifference. Thus, various perspectives are needed to face the threat of regional and global environmental changes, where moderation attitude is one of the solutions in meeting the increasingly fast-paced world transformation.

The discussion of the study indicates that three textbooks on religious intolerance for SMA prepared by the government does not provide strong values to serve tolerance teaching proper to the millennial contexts the SMA students face in this era. It implies that reorganization of the textbook that serve actual tolerance values with appropriate contexts are required. However, this research has showed the novelty the previous researches did not provide. The novelty is of four religious moderation topics: national commitment, love for the homeland, antiviolence, and accommodation to local culture, national commitment and local culture are the core values of this research.

Conclusion

Religious learning practiced in schools has not realized the moderation attitude of students. It was shown in this study that the Islamic Religious and Morals Education textbooks, which have become compulsory textbooks used in schools, have not thoroughly instilled the values of religious moderation in students. This happened because the material contained in the book was still less comprehensive in building religious moderation based on religious moderation indicators. Additionally, the influence of PAI teachers indicated that they had no or even opposed the existence of religious moderation. This has caused many intolerance cases that have led to rampant

30 intolerance in the school environment. Likewise, extracurricular activities to support the formation of student moderation attitudes have not been employed optimally. Thus, the religious moderation attitude in schools can be realized by accommodating three aspects: the content of the material, the teacher as a knowledge transfer, and the use of extracurricular activities.

A religious moderation approach to religion was applied in this study as a conceptual basis for observing the Islamic learning process. The concept is used either to answer the problems of this study or to respond to the emergence of intolerant attitudes among students. It was also possible to find the classification of religious moderation attitudes of students continuously undertaken through educational institutions. The revision of Islamic Religious and Moral Education textbooks published by the Ministry of Education and Culture for grades X, XI, and XII SMA levels is recommended by this study, considering that the content of religious moderation is still deficient. Additionally, the results of this study can become a reference for authorities to consider the background of teachers who will teach Islamic religious education subjects. In this case, teachers responsible for teaching Islamic religious education subjects should understand religious moderation well because teachers are role models for their students. The novelty of this study lies on themes of national commitment and local culture are the core values of this research. This research is still limited to small data sources because the school-level research is only at the high school level. Additionally, the responses of students regarding PAI learning in schools have not been explored in this study, and only the perspective of the teacher was considered. Therefore, it is still possible to conduct further research with more comprehensive data sources. Likewise, a comparative analysis is also needed, considering that the number of schools spread across Indonesia with various community backgrounds may affect the religious attitudes of students. Therefore, this study allows further research to thoroughly explore religious moderation at the elementary, junior high, high school, and university levels.

References

- Abdullah, I., Jubba, H., Pabbajah, M., Sari, IP, Zuhri, S., & Ermas, S. (2019). From selfism to indifferentism: Challenges facing Indonesian society and culture, 2015-2045. *Academic Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies*, 8(3), 102–112. <https://doi.org/10.36941/ajis-2019-0009>
- Abror, M. (2020). Moderasi Beragama Dalam Bingkai Toleransi. *Jurnal Pemikiran Islam*. <https://doi.org/10.35961/rsd.v1i2.174>

- Agis, A., Diaz, M., Rustam, G., Islam, U., & Sunan, N. (2018). Islam Nusantara: Moderasi Islam Di Indonesia. *Journal of Islamic Studies and Humanities*, 3(2), 153–168. <https://doi.org/10.21580/jish.32.3160>
- Akhmadi, A. (2019). Moderasi Beragama Dalam Keragaman Indonesia religious moderation in Indonesia's diversity. *Jurnal Diklat Keagamaan*. <https://bdksurabaya.e-journal.id/bdksurabaya/article/view/82/45>
- Alabdulhadi, MMJ (2019). Religious tolerance in secondary Islamic education textbooks in Kuwait. *British Journal of Religious Education*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2019.1585329>
- Aman, M. (2020). Kurikulum Pendidikan Berbasis Al-Qur'an. *RausyanFikr: Jurnal Pemikiran Dan Pencerahan*. <https://doi.org/10.31000/rf.v16i1.2418>
- Anwar, B. (2016). Pendidikan Islam Melalui Kemahiran Berfikir Membentuk Moral Dan Akhlakul Karimah Pelajar Islam. *Al Daulah: Jurnal Hukum Pidana Dan Ketatanegaraan*. <https://doi.org/10.24252/ad.v5i2.4853>
- Anwar, F., & Haq, I. (2019). Religious moderation campaign through social media at multicultural communities. *Kuriositas: Media Komunikasi Sosial Dan Keagamaan*. <https://doi.org/10.35905/kur.v12i2.1392>
- Basri, HH (2021, August 25). Mengembangkan Alat Ukur Moderasi Beragama. <https://www.kemendiknas.go.id/read/mengembangkan-alat-ukur-moderasi-beragama-y5jwk>
- Besançon, M., & Lubart, T. (2008). Differences in the development of creative competencies in children schooled in diverse learning environments. *Learning and Individual Differences*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lindif.2007.11.009>
- Brabeck, MM, Rogers, LA, Sirin, S., Henderson, J., Benvenuto, M., Weaver, M., & Ting, K. (2000). Increasing ethical sensitivity to racial and gender intolerance in schools: Development of the racial ethical sensitivity test. *Ethics and Behavior*. https://doi.org/10.1207/S15327019EB1002_02
- Creswell, J.W. (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches (4th Ed.)*. London: SAGE Publications.
- De Alencar, EMLS, De Souza Fleith, D., & Pereira, N. (2017). Creativity in higher education: Challenges and facilitating factors. *Temas Em Psicologia*. <https://doi.org/10.9788/TP2017.2-09>
- Dhani, RR (2020). Peran Guru Dalam Pengembangan Kurikulum. *Jurnal Serunai Administrasi Pendidikan*. <https://doi.org/10.37755/jsap.v9i1.251>
- Djollong, AF, & Akbar, A. (2019). Peran Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam Dalam Penanaman Nilai-

Nilai Toleransi Antar Ummat Beragama Peserta Didik Untuk Mewujudkan Kerukunan. *Al-Ibrah: Jurnal Pemikiran Dan Pendidikan Islam*.
<http://jurnal.umpar.ac.id/index.php/ibrah/article/view/22/18>

Dodego, SHA, & Witro, D. (2020). The Islamic moderation and the prevention of radicalism and religious extremism In Indonesia. *Dialogue*. <https://doi.org/10.47655/dialog.v43i2.375>

Effendi, MR (2020). Mitigasi Intoleransi dan Radikalisme Beragama di Pondok Pesantren Melalui Pendekatan Pembelajaran Inklusif. *Paedagogie: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Studi Islam*. <https://doi.org/10.52593/pgd.01.1.05>

Fahrudin, AH, Maskuri, & Busri, H. (2021). Internalisasi Nilai Multikulturalis melalui Pendidikan Islam; Interelasi Tri Sentra Pendidikan pada Masyarakat Multireligius Desa Balun Lamongan. *Indonesian Journal of Islamic Education Studies (IJIES)*. <https://doi.org/10.33367/ijies.v4i1.1633>

Febrianto, R., & Puspitaningsih, F. (2020). Pengembangan Buku Ajar Evaluasi Pembelajaran. *Education Journal: Journal Educational Research and Development*. <https://doi.org/10.31537/ej.v4i1.297>

Ferdian, Y., & Alpizar, A. (2021). Belajar Toleransi Di Sekolah Studi di SMA Negeri 2 Tualang Kabupaten Siak. *Toleransi: Media Ilmiah Komunikasi Umat Beragama*. <https://doi.org/10.24014/trs.v13i1.13650>

Feriyanto. (2020). Tarekat and religious moderation. *Tatar Pasundan*. Doi:10.38075/tp.v14i2.104

Futaqi, S., & Mashuri, S. (2021). Religious moderation cyber: Sebuah Strategi Pengarusutamaan Melalui Literasi Media Baru. *Tatar Pasundan: Jurnal Diklat Keagamaan*. <https://doi.org/10.38075/tp.v15i2.233>

Gazali, M. (2013). Optimalisasi Peran Lembaga Pendidikan Untuk Mencerdaskan Bangsa. *Jurnal Al-Ta'dib*, 6, 126–136. Doi:10.31332/atdb.v6i1.295

Gerlinger, J. (2017). Structural inequality in school discipline: Regulating intolerance in public schools. In *ProQuest Dissertations and Theses*. <https://escholarship.org/content/qt8sq6h2mg/qt8sq6h2mg.pdf?t=owbm03&v=lg>

Gunio, M. (2021). Determining the Influences of a Hidden Curriculum on Students' Character Development Using the Illuminative Evaluation Model. *Journal of Curriculum Studies Research*, 3(2), 194-206. <https://doi.org/10.46303/jcsr.2021.11>

Harto, K., & Tastin, T. (2019). Pengembangan Pembelajaran PAI Berwawasan Islam Wasatiyah: Upaya Membangun Sikap Moderasi Beragama Peserta Didik. *At-Ta'lim: Media Informasi Pendidikan Islam*. <https://doi.org/10.29300/attalim.v18i1.1280>

Hatim, M. (2018). Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam di Sekolah Umum. *El-Hikmah: Jurnal*

- Kajian Dan Penelitian Pendidikan Islam*. <https://doi.org/10.20414/elhikmah.v1i2i2.265>
- Ikhsanudin, A. (2020). Viral Guru SMAN 58 DKI Ajak Pilih Ketua OSIS Seagama, Ini Penjelasan Kepsek. Retrieved August 25, 2021, from <https://news.detik.com/berita/d-5232714/viral-guru-sman-58-dki-ajak-pilih-ketua-osis-seagama-ini-penjelasan-kepsek#>
- Jannah, R. (2016). Pengembangan Buku Ajar Tematik Bernuansa Islami untuk Madrasah Ibtidaiyah/ Sekolah Dasar Islam. *Jurnal Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*. <http://jurnal.radenfatah.ac.id/index.php/edukasi/article/view/626/552>
- Juahab, J. (2019). Peran Dan Tanggung Jawab Kepala Sekolah Dan Guru Dalam Pengembangan Kurikulum. *Bada'a: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dasar*. <https://doi.org/10.37216/badaa.v1i1.241>
- Kanafi, I., Dahri, H., Susminingsih, S., & Bakhri, S. (2021). The contribution of ahlussunnah waljamaah's theology in establishing moderate Islam in Indonesia. *HTS Theologiese Studies/Theological Studies*. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v77i4.6437>
- Kato, H. (2018a). Religion and locality: The case of the Islam Nusantara movement in Indonesia. *Fieldwork in Religion*. <https://doi.org/10.1558/irn.37050>
- Kato, H. (2018b). Religion and locality. *Fieldwork in Religion*. <https://doi.org/10.1558/irn.37050>
- Khakim, A. (2018). Konsep Pendidikan Islam Perspektif Muhaimin. *Jurnal Al-Makrifat*. <http://ejournal.kopertais4.or.id/tapalkuda/index.php/makrifat/article/view/3211/2384>
- Kicherova, M.N., & Efimova, G.Z. (2020). The impact of non-formal education on human capital: A generational approach. *Integration of Education*. <https://doi.org/10.15507/1991-9468.099.024.202002.316-338>
- Kusmawati, H., & Surachman, AI (2019). Glokalisasi Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam Madrasah Aliyah Keagamaan Di Era Revolusi Industri 4.0. *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dasar*. <https://doi.org/10.30659/pendas.6.2.98-115>
- Lenssen, G. (2010). Practical wisdom for turbulent times: Exegesis beyond historical and canonical concerns. *Journal of Management Development*. <https://doi.org/10.1108/02621711011059121>
- Luthfi, KM (2016). Islam Nusantara: Relasi Islam dan Budaya Lokal. *Shahih: Journal of Islamicate Multidisciplinary*. <https://doi.org/10.22515/shahih.v1i1.53>
- Mackey, W., & Dolven, B. (2020). Religious intolerance in Indonesia. In *Religious Freedom: Violations, Laws and US Policy*. Nova Science Publishers.
- Mandayu, YYB (2020). Pembentukan Karakter Toleransi Melalui Habituasi Sekolah. *Jurnal PIPSI (Jurnal Pendidikan IPS Indonesia)*. <https://doi.org/10.26737/jpipi.v5i2.1598>

- Miles, Matthew B.; Huberman, Michael, A & Saldana, Jhonny. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis A Methods Sourcebook*. 3rd ed. eds. Helen Salmon, Kaitlin Perry, Kalie Koscielak, and Laura Barrent. Los Angeles: SAGE Publication.
- Mubarok, AA, & Rustam, DG (2018). Islam Nusantara: Moderasi Islam di Indonesia. *Journal of Islamic Studies and Humanities*, 3(2), 153–168. <https://doi.org/DOI:https://doi.org/10.21580/jish.32.3160>
- Muhaimin. (2014). Pengembangan Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Jurnal Kependidikan*.
- Muhajir, A. (2022). Inclusion of pluralism character education in the Islamic modern boarding schools during the pandemic era, *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 13(2), 196-220, <https://jsser.org/index.php/jsser/article/view/4233/567>
- Nasir, M. (2021). Curriculum Development and Accreditation Standards in the Traditional Islamic Schools in Indonesia. *Journal of Curriculum Studies Research*, 3(2), 37-56. <https://doi.org/10.46303/jcsr.2020.3>
- News, BI (2021, August 25). Wajib jilbab bagi siswi non-Muslim di Padang: “Sekolah negeri cenderung gagal terapkan kebhinekaan.” <https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/indonesia-55806826>
- Nyamai, D. (2021). The Secreted Curriculum and Youth Education to Become the Professionals the World Craves for. *Journal Of Curriculum Studies Research*, 3(2), 169-193. <https://doi.org/10.46303/jcsr.2021.10>
- Nurhasanah, N. (2020). Peran Guru Dan Kepala Sekolah Dalam Pengembangan Kurikulum Madrasah Di MTs Muhammadiyah Balangnipa. *Jurnal Al-Qalam: Jurnal Kajian Islam & Pendidikan*. <https://doi.org/10.47435/al-qalam.v9i1.253>
- Nurmadiyah, N. (2016). Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Al-Afkar: Jurnal Keislaman & Peradaban*. <https://doi.org/10.28944/afkar.v2i2.93>
- Pabbajah, M., Jubba, H., Abdullah, I., Pabbajah, MTH, & Juhansar. (2021). From the scriptural to the virtual: Indonesian engineering students responses to the digitalization of Islamic education. *Teaching Theology and Religion*. <https://doi.org/10.1111/teth.12581>
- Parker, L. (2014). Religious education for peaceful coexistence in Indonesia? *South-East Asia Research*. <https://doi.org/10.5367/sear.2014.0231>
- Pilotti, M., & Al Mubarak, H. (2021). Systematic versus informal application of culturally relevant pedagogy: Are performance outcomes different? A study of college students. *Journal of Culture and Values in Education*, 4(2), 14-26. <https://doi.org/10.46303/jcve.2021.1>
- Prasojo, ZH, & Pabbajah, M. (2020). Akomodasi Kultural Dalam Resolusi Konflik Bernuansa Agama Di Indonesia. *JurnalAqlam – Journal of Islam and Plurality*.

<http://dx.doi.org/10.30984/ajip.v5i1.1131>

- Ramli, R. (2019). Moderasi Beragama bagi Minoritas Muslim Etnis Tionghoa di Kota Makassar. *Kuriositas: Media Komunikasi Sosial Dan Keagamaan*. <https://doi.org/10.35905/kur.v12i2.1219>
- Ridho, H. (2021). Membangun Toleransi Beragama Berlandaskan Konsep Moderasi dalam Al-Qur'an dan Pancasila. *An-Natiq: Jurnal Kajian Islam Interdisipliner*. <http://www.riset.unisma.ac.id/index.php/natiq/article/view/9069/7363>
- Rodríguez Illera, JL (2018). Informal education, everyday life and tacit learning. *Teoria de La Educacion*. <https://doi.org/10.14201/teoredu301259272>
- Rohman, DA (2020). Moderasi Islam Indonesia Dalam Media Cetak. *Tatar Pasundan :JurnalDiklatKeagamaan*. <https://doi.org/10.38075/tp.v14i2.119>
- Sebastian, LC, & Arifianto, AR (2020). TRaNS special section on growing religious intolerance in Indonesia. *TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia*. <https://doi.org/10.1017/trn.2020.1>
- Shannon-Baker, P. (2018). A multicultural education praxis: Integrating past and present, living theories, and practice. *International Journal of Multicultural Education*. <https://doi.org/10.18251/ijme.v20i1.1518>
- Shoji, M., Takafuji, Y., & Harada, T. (2020). Formal education and disaster response of children: evidence from coastal villages in Indonesia. *Natural Hazards*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11069-020-04077-7>
- Sihombing, AA, Abdullah, I., & Prasajo, ZH (2020). Nostra Aetate and space for religious moderation: Interfaith dialogue in multicultural Indonesia. *Journal for the Study of Religions and Ideologies*. <http://www.jsri.ro/ojs/index.php/jsri/article/view/1189/840>
- Sirry, M. (2020). Muslim Student Radicalism and Self-Deradicalization in Indonesia. *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09596410.2020.1770665>
- Somer, M. (2017). Conquering versus democratizing the state: Political Islamists and fourth wave democratization in Turkey and Tunisia. *Democratization*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13510347.2016.1259216>
- Suntana, I., & Tresnawaty, B. (2021). Multidimensional Social Crisis and Religious Violence in Southeast Asia: Regional Strategic Agenda, Weak Civilian Government, Triune Crime, Wealth Gaps, and Coopted Journalism. *Journal of Culture and Values in Education*, 4(2), 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.46303/jcve.2021.2>
- Sutrisno, E. (2019). Aktualisasi Moderasi Beragama di Lembaga Pendidikan. *Jurnal Bimas Islam*. <https://doi.org/10.37302/jbi.v12i2.113>

- Wafi, A. (2017). Konsep Dasar Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Edureligia; Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*. <https://doi.org/10.33650/edureligia.v1i2.741>
- Wahyudi, D. (2021). Literasi Moderasi Beragama Sebagai Reaktualisasi “Jihad Milenial” Era 4.0. *Jurnal Moderasi Beragama*. <https://e-journal.metrouniv.ac.id/index.php/moderatio/article/view/3287>
- Wibowo, A. (2019). Kampanye Moderasi Beragama di Facebook: Bentuk dan Strategi Pesan. *Edugama: Jurnal Kependidikan dan Sosial Keagamaan*. <https://doi.org/10.32923/edugama.v5i2.971>
- Yudi Latif. (2020). Pasang-Surut Komitmen Kebangsaan. *Konfrontasi: Jurnal Kultural, Ekonomi dan Perubahan Sosial*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/konfrontasi2.v3i1.68>
- Zhang, Yan & Wildemuth, Barbara. (2016). *Qualitative Analysis of Content*. Available online at: <https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Qualitative-Analysis-of-Content-by-Zhang-Wildemuth/b269343ab82ba8b7a343b893815a0bae6472fcca>.
- Zain, A. (2020). Strategi Penanaman Toleransi Beragama Anak Usia Dini. *PAUD Lectura: Jurnal Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini*. <https://doi.org/10.31849/paud-lectura.v4i01.4987>
- Zilliacus, H., Holm, G., & Sahlström, F. (2017). Taking steps towards institutionalizing multicultural education–The national curriculum of Finland. *Multicultural Education Review*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2005615X.2017.1383810>
- Zuchdi, D., Ghufron, A., Syamsi, K., Masruri, & Siasah, M. (2014). Pemetaan Implementasi Pendidikan Karakter Di SD, SMP, SMA. *Pendidikan Karakter*. <https://doi.org/10.21831/jpk.v0i2.2172>



IAIN PALOPO

Religious Moderation in Islamic Religious Education as a Response to Intolerance Attitudes in Indonesian Educational Institutions

ORIGINALITY REPORT

12%

SIMILARITY INDEX

10%

INTERNET SOURCES

6%

PUBLICATIONS

2%

STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	Submitted to Universitas Negeri Jakarta Student Paper	1%
2	journal.ummat.ac.id Internet Source	1%
3	journal.blasemarang.id Internet Source	1%
4	dergipark.org.tr Internet Source	<1%
5	ejournal.kopertais4.or.id Internet Source	<1%
6	repository.iainpalopo.ac.id Internet Source	<1%
7	Ashadi L. Diab, Rizal Darwis, Asni Zubair, Sitti Selamita. "Legal Construction against Customer Deposit Protection as a Result Liquidity of PT Bank Perkreditan Rakyat Mustika Utama Kolaka", Al-Bayyinah, 2022 Publication	<1%

8	zenodo.org Internet Source	<1 %
9	files.eric.ed.gov Internet Source	<1 %
10	Alfurqan Alfurqan, Ajat Hidayat. "Internalization of Moderation Values in Islamic Religious Education Subjects in SMP Negeri 22 Padang", MANAZHIM, 2023 Publication	<1 %
11	jurnal.iain-padangsidimpuan.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
12	Baamphattha Dinama, Rebecca Khaza Moseki, Vivian Olesitse. "Religious and Moral Education Textbooks in Upper Primary Schools in Botswana – A Question of Relevance", European Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences, 2021 Publication	<1 %
13	ejournal.unuja.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
14	eprints.unm.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
15	jsser.org Internet Source	<1 %
16	jurnalpaedagogia.com Internet Source	<1 %

17

Luthfi Salim, Aulia Amrina Rosada. "Conflict Management in Indonesia Through Religious Moderation", KnE Social Sciences, 2023

Publication

<1 %

18

Mustaqim Pabbajah, Hasse Jubba, Irwan Abdullah, M. Taufiq Hidayat Pabbajah, Juhansar. "From the scriptural to the virtual: Indonesian engineering students responses to the digitalization of Islamic education", Teaching Theology & Religion, 2021

Publication

<1 %

19

ejournal.uinsaid.ac.id

Internet Source

<1 %

20

m.amnews.com

Internet Source

<1 %

21

proceedings.uinsaizu.ac.id

Internet Source

<1 %

22

repository.iainpurwokerto.ac.id

Internet Source

<1 %

23

serialsjournals.com

Internet Source

<1 %

24

Adon Nasrullah Jamaludin. "Religious Moderation: The Concept and Practice in Higher Education Institutions", AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan, 2022

Publication

<1 %

IAIN PALOPO

25	Irma Noviana. "THE ROLE OF TEACHERS IN THE APPLICATION OF RELIGIOUS MODERATION IN ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS", Annual International Conference on Islamic Education for Students, 2022 Publication	<1 %
26	Majed Mohammad Abdullah Alzahrani. "The Role of Saudi Universities in Promoting Moderation among their Students", Journal of International Cooperation and Development, 2023 Publication	<1 %
27	e-journal.iainsalatiga.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
28	ejournal.iaida.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
29	ejournal.radenintan.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
30	journal.uinmataram.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
31	Ika Kartika, Saepudin Saepudin, Anandha Budiantoro, Sukarna Sukarna. "Inovasi pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Berbasis ICT di Era Industri 4.0", EduInovasi: Journal of Basic Educational Studies, 2023 Publication	<1 %

32 Noviyana Rustam, Murniati Murniati, Niswanto Niswanto. "The Principal Strategy for Improving the Quality of Learning at an Integrated Islamic Elementary School", AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan, 2021
Publication <1 %

33 alhayat.or.id
Internet Source <1 %

34 digilib.umpalopo.ac.id:8080
Internet Source <1 %

35 doaj.org
Internet Source <1 %

36 ejournal.uin-suska.ac.id
Internet Source <1 %

37 ejurnal.staiattaqwa.ac.id
Internet Source <1 %

38 etheses.uin-malang.ac.id
Internet Source <1 %

39 hts.org.za
Internet Source <1 %

40 jurnal.radenfatah.ac.id
Internet Source <1 %

41 jurnaliainpontianak.or.id
Internet Source <1 %



IAIN PALOPO

42

www.internationalstudentsymposium.com

Internet Source

<1 %

43

"Global Perspectives on Catholic Religious Education in Schools", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2019

Publication

<1 %

44

ejournal.insuriponorogo.ac.id

Internet Source

<1 %

45

Alfauzan Amin, Zubaedi, Asiyah, Abd. Amri Siregar, Jaenullah, Alimni. "The Relationship of Education on Healthy Living Values of Multicultural Islamic Perspective with Healthy Lifestyle Behavior of Junior High School Students in Bengkulu, Indonesia", Research Square Platform LLC, 2021

Publication

<1 %

46

Subhan Hi Ali Dodego, Arisatul Muwafiqoh, Buya Hamka, Maulana Aminudin. "The Influence of Radical Islam on the Quality of Islamic Education in Schools", Sustainable Jurnal Kajian Mutu Pendidikan, 2022

Publication

<1 %

Exclude quotes OnExclude matches OffExclude bibliography On